EXHIBIT "A"
HARRY R. CARTER, Ph.D. REPORT, DATED OCTOBER 14, 2016

Harry R. Carter, Ph.D., L.L.C.
Municipal Fire Protection Consultant
Post Office Box 100
Adelphia, NJ 07710-0100

Home (732) 431-1639 Cell (732) 513-8457

REPORT TO TOWNSHIP OF VOORHEES

October 14, 2016

This report was created based upon the following:

1. An array of Fire District documents which were provided by Voorhees Township
2. Interviews with three of the five fire commissioners
3. Interviews with members of the career staff (fire and EMS)
4. Interviews with members of the volunteer staff (fire)
5. Interviews with civilian staff members
6. Meetings and discussions with Township Counsel, the Township Administrator, the Deputy Mayor, a member of the township council and the Township Finance Director

Documents Reviewed

1. IRS Issues for Firefighters
2. U.S. Department of Labor WISHARD Compliance Action Report
3. 40A:14-70 New Jersey Fire District Regulations
4. New Jersey Regulations on Dissolution of Authority by Local Unit
5. Unit Arrival Time Analysis (2013, 2014, 2015)
6. Average response Time of First Arriving Unit (2013, 2014, 2015)
7. 2010 Fire District Budget
8. 2011 Fire District Budget
9. 2012 Fire District Budget

10. 2013 Fire District Budget

11. 2014 Fire District Budget

12. 2015 Fire District Budget

13. 2016 Fire District Budget

14. Audit Report for year Ended December 31, 2012

15. Audit Report for year Ended December 31, 2013

16. Audit Report for year Ended December 31, 2014

17. Weekly Staffing Report(24/7)

18. Fire Operations Questions

19. Fleet Management Plan

20. Questions on ISO Report

21. Report on Failing PEOSHA Inspection (with fine of $15,000 listed)

22. Proposed 2016 Budget documents

23. Certification of 2008 Fire District actions on new station

24. 2016 Department of Community Affairs Budgeting Requirements

25. Paperwork on hydrant and hydrant rental payments and issues about same with the New Jersey American Water Company

26. Courier Post article on issues between union and Chief Pacifico

27. Sample attendance Roster

28. Vehicle inventory

29. Vacation/Sick Leave/Time Off Roster

30. W-2 forms for 2011

31. 1099 forms for 2010

32. W-2 forms 2013

33. W-2 forms 2014

34. 2013 Voorhees Fire District Staffing & Deployment Assessment

35. Number of Fire District Fire and EMS calls 2013, 2014, 2015

36. Reports on EMS Billing Reports 2013, 2014, 2015

37. Contract for Burnt Mill Road Station

38. Vendor activity reports 2013, 2014, 2015

39. Court Paperwork for law suit against American LaFrance

40. Court paperwork on DeFilippis vs Voorhees Fire District law suit

41. Heavily redacted Payroll Register for 2015

42. Heavily redacted Monthly Journal 2010

43. Heavily redacted Payroll Journal and Monthly Journal 12/11/11 to 12/24/11

44. Heavily redacted Payroll Journal and Monthly Journal 12/09/12 to 12/22/12

45. Heavily redacted Payroll Register 12-08-2013 to 12/21/2013

46. Miscellaneous 1099 forms for 2011

47. Miscellaneous 1099 forms for 2012

48. Miscellaneous 1099 forms for 2013

49. Miscellaneous 1099 forms for 2014

50. National Fire Protection Association Fire Codes and Standards

51. Standard and Poor's Rating report on Voorhees Township Fire District #3 dated May 4, 2016

52. Vote of no confidence by IAFF Local 3249 against the Voorhees Township Board of Fire Commissioners District 3 and Deputy Chief Michael Wharton

53. October 11, 2016 letter from the International Association of Firefighters Local 3249 in which the union representing the career firefighters and emergency medical technicians calls for the dissolution of the fire district.

Findings from Staff Interviews (All Findings are based upon Comments Made by Each Class of Individuals Who Were Interviewed)

1. In the 2016 budget the board allocated $75,000 for overtime in 2016 when the overtime for last year was well in excess of $300,000.

2. The fire staff is concerned over the lack of fire service experience among the board of commissioners and the impact this has upon the delivery of fire protection services in the township.

3. The board failed to increase taxes over a period of time in order to allow it to cover the cost of the new fire station. This occurred in the years prior to the signing of the "two-percent cap law" by the state.

4. Based upon numerous comments the board used its capital reserve to cover the cost of the bond payments for the new station when this should have been accomplished by raising the annual fire tax rate to cover the cost of the building while maintaining an adequate budgetary surplus. This fact was noted in the S&P report of May 4,2016.

5. The threat of layoffs apparently was used as a bargaining tool by the board. It was put forward, but never occurred.

6. The current EMS staff is a mix of full-time career and career per diem.

7. I am in agreement with those people with whom I spoke that an outside, civilian administrator is needed in order to provide better support services to improve the delivery of fire protection services.

8. Based upon a number of comments the board of fire commissioners never used the report of Mr. Robert Hill on the matter of harassment.

9. Current contract negotiations between the board and the union are not progressing because of an uncertainty over available funding.

10. Based upon the comments of numerous individuals, the training program for the department is insufficient to the needs of an active, suburban community such as Voorhees Township. The daily training is not sufficient to adequately cover any topic being presented. The training schedule I reviewed was not sufficient to cover the range of topics with which a modern fire department must be conversant. The emphasis on training has had a negative impact upon the department's ability to provide effective municipal fire protection services.

11. The condition of the department support-vehicle fleet is not good.

12. There is a need for new turnout gear and self-contained breathing apparatus.

13. The fleet of ambulances is aging out. Existing equipment does not have the latest technical innovations such as an electric lifting capability. This situation exposes the EMS staff to possible lifting injuries.

14. The fire apparatus fleet is going to be leased again. This was confirmed to me at the workshop meeting on April 7.

15. It was said to me by more than one person that the board intends to buy out the existing American-LaFrance lease. This was confirmed to me during my attendance at the April 7, 2016 workshop meeting of the board.

16. The board of fire commissioners did not plan for the costs of running and maintaining the new station to be included within their budget.

17. Based upon the comments of many individuals, there is confusion within the fire department as to who is supposed to be doing what. This is a serious safety issue because it can lead to important fire department operational, personnel, training, and operational tasks being overlooked or not performed.

18. My review of the Standard and Poor's (S&P) Rating Report indicated that the fire district bonds have been downgraded due to a negative outlook on the district's finances due to a finding of significant deterioration of the board's finances. The financial reserve posture of the district has been significantly reduced from prior levels. S&P noted that the board had posted deficits in five of the past six years.

19. This S&P downgrade also reflects the fact that they see only a one in three chance that the board "...will return reserves to their former strong levels over the next couple of years."

My Professional Opinions Based Upon My Interviews and a Review of Information Provided to Me by Voorhees Township

1. Over the past decade the board of fire commissioners failed to increase fire district taxes in a way which would have allowed them to cover the cost of building the new fire station without draining their capital reserve. This has required that operational funding be used for capital expenditures. This a fire safety issue because it has allowed for a number of negative things to occur. The apparatus fleet has grown older and less in tune with the appropriate National Fire Protection Association (NFPA) standards. In addition, ambulance fleet has aged out and does not meet the current standards for state of the art equipment including the latest technological innovations. Further, new turnout gear and breathing apparatus, as well as other equipment has not been acquired and a variety of tools have not been purchased. This has an impact on the level and quality of service which the fire district has been able to provide.

2. In my opinion the board of fire commissioners has ignored requirements for conducting labor relations. This has led to staffing issues which have required fire and EMS employees to work long hours on successive days. This has the potential for diminishing the ability of the individual members to respond in an alert and effective manner making this a safety issue. This has also required the expenditure of funds on legal matters which could have been better spent on operational issues.

3. Over the past twenty years, board members have abdicated their role in conducting the business of the fire district. They have given this over to the individuals charged with leading the fire department. It began with the late Chief Maxfield; it continued with retired Chief Pacifico, and has now been given to Deputy Chief Wharton. I saw this in action at the workshop meeting of the board which I attended back in April. This has led to a situation where important tasks are not being accomplished in a timely fashion and necessary equipment and staffing decisions are being put off due to a lack of attention and fiscal support.

4. It is my opinion that the board of fire commissioners does not understand what the actual needs for the position of deputy chief are. This has allowed for a situation to develop where things such as pension payments are not being made in a timely fashion. This has led to morale issues which always have an impact upon the effective delivery of fire protection services.

5. It is my opinion that there is no long-range planning for any aspect of department operations, fiscal or otherwise. This creates problem preparing for future fire safety-related operations and programs.

6. It is my opinion that the board of fire commissioners has failed to recognize the problems which they have created by the use of a Deputy Chief to run the fire department rather than a Fire Chief. They have created dissention between and among the staff which can create a fire safety problem when it comes to creating a unified fire protection team.

7. Owing to a series of administrative and managerial missteps, the board has placed themselves into a position where they lack the fiscal and operational resources to conduct their operations in an effective and efficient manner. This has a direction impact upon fire safety in the areas of staffing, apparatus, equipment, and maintenance. These issues form the bulk of the service delivery model for any fire department.

8. My portrayal of the operation of the fire district was confirmed by the findings of the Standard and Poors Ratings Direct Report on Voorhees Township Fire District #3 dated May 4, 2016 when they downgraded the district's bonds and spoke of their concern on the management of district financial resources. It is this lack of sufficient resources which has led to problems in providing proper staffing levels, up-to-date fire, and EMS apparatus as well as shortfalls in self-contained breathing apparatus and other fire department equipment. And these problems have manifested themselves in the vote of no-confidence which was taken by the union which represents the career firefighters and EMS technicians.

9. Based upon my review of the data I received, as supplemented by my many interviews and my five decades in the fire service, my sixteen years as a fire commissioner, and my ten years as a fire district board chairman, and my many years in a leadership role with the New Jersey Association of Fire Districts, I must state that the Voorhees Township Board of Fire Commissioners is perhaps the most poorly managed fire district with which I have ever interacted. Their inability to manage staff, provide adequate financial resources, develop adequate operational resources, and provide proper equipment has led to the point where I must recommend that Voorhees Township Fire District #3 should be dissolved. My opinion is supported by the letter from the union representing the career firefighters and EMS technicians which also called for the dissolution of the fire district.

Harry R. Carter, Ph.D.